
WORKPLACE ETHICS IN ENUGU STATE CIVIL SERVICE: PERISCOPING THE EFFECT ON EMPLOYEES' PERFORMANCE

EGBARA, Edward A. Ph.D¹ & OFODU, Henry I. Ph.D²

¹⁻² Department of Public Administration and Local Government, University of Nigeria,
Nsukka

Corresponding Author: Ofodu, H.I. ikechukwuhenry20@gmail.com, 08037803691

Abstract: *The workplace attitude and emphasis on competence, commitment, clientele satisfaction and workload delivery of the Nigerian civil servants have painted a rather negative picture of an apathetic, uncommitted and unethical workforce who has been demoralized by the poor remuneration and repellent motivational techniques. This study examined the Effect of Workplace Ethics on Employees' Performance in Enugu State Civil Service, Nigeria. The specific objectives are to examine the effect of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants; the effect of loyalty on employee workload delivery; and how teamwork influences the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service. The study adopted a descriptive survey research design. The population of the study was 1,664 staff and sample size of 322. The simple random sampling technique was used to select the sample for the study. The data collected were presented and analyzed using mean score and standard deviation, while hypotheses were tested using chi-square (χ^2) analytical tool. The study revealed that integrity has significant positive effect on level of clientele satisfaction (χ^2 cal. of 32.24 > χ^2 tab. of 15.51), loyalty has significant positive effect on employee workload delivery (χ^2 cal. of 29.86 > χ^2 tab. of 15.51), teamwork has significant influence on the competence of civil servants (χ^2 cal. of 24.03 > χ^2 tab. of 15.51) in Enugu State Civil Service. It was concluded that the urge to attain and maintain high level of ethical conducts in workplace is desirable for the success and survival of any organization whether public or private. Based on these findings and conclusion, the study recommended among other things the need for policy makers to ensure that workplace ethics are consistent with employees' actual experience as well as ensuring that adherence to ethical policies are not overlooked but well compensated to strengthen and sustain employees adherence to ethical codes in Enugu State Civil Service and Nigeria in general.*

Keywords: *Ethics, Workplace Ethics, Integrity, Loyalty, Teamwork, Employees Performance*

INTRODUCTION

Workplace ethics is essential for any organization to get the best performance from the employees they have, while unethical behaviors can derail even the best of organizations. Employee's abysmal failure to uphold ethical behavior within the workplace and the framework of employment relationship necessitates continuous interrogation of the complex issues which arise from the asymmetry between workplace ethics and employees' performance. Workplace ethics in any organization is very crucial for general development, efficiency in the production of goods and services for both domestic consumption and international trade or exchange, creation of national wealth, the attainment of political stability and the inclusive benefits of sustainable human developments (De-Zoysa, 2022). In other words, how well an organization adheres to ethical standards in the workplace, obviously determines the well-being of all the stakeholders, the employees' performance, organizational productivity and the subsequent viability, as well as the macroeconomic growth and development of the nation.

However, workplace ethics as noted by Ahmad, Ahmad & Idrees (2010) is the accepted standards in terms of personal and social welfare of employees, their work attitudes, integrity, loyalty and commitment to their assignments. Adeyeye, Adeniji, Osinbanjo, Oludayo (2015) observed that workplace ethics is the principle of conduct governing an individual or a group of people in the workplace, which makes them conform to the ethical standards thus influencing individual employee's performance and organizational output level and the resultant performance level.

The concept of performance as applicable to the context of employment relationship is a function of proper management of employees at workplace, including the adherence to workplace ethical standards. The totality of the essence of work in society is that it is the primary determinism around which human lives are ordered, organizations improved and nations are developed. Also, the primacy of work in society and the critical role of the production function have naturally contributed to the growth, development and advancement of nations throughout human history. In practical terms, nations are in existence to provide security, safety and most importantly developments to people who had surrendered their sovereignty in exchange for the aforementioned necessities of life, using organizations and all human resources available to them (Ulabor, Akande, Abiodun, 2020).

Any behavior contrary to the expectations of these actors would rather hinder the trajectory of performance and the development of the organizations. Since national development is dependent on what the labor can generate by way of Gross Domestic Products (GDP), a substantial attention must be paid to the agreement legally, socially and economically entered into by all the stakeholders for the parties to enjoy the expected efficiency, equity and development, which are the main objectives of employment relationship and the overall impact on the organizational performance.

The work attitudes, integrity, loyalty, teamwork, and emphasis on workload delivery, competence, clientele satisfaction and high productivity of the Enugu State Civil Servants and Nigerian workers in general have painted a rather negative picture of an apathetic, uncommitted men and women, who have been demoralized by the poor remuneration and repellent motivational techniques. The Nigerian workers have been described as indolent, apathetic and unresponsive to motivation and generally, not willing to put forth maximum productive efforts (Salau, Faiola & Akinbode, 2021). The Nigerian workers must be encouraged to make meaningful contribution to the development of the nation by becoming more productive. Given this background, periscoping the effect of workplace ethics on employees' performance in Enugu State Civil Service becomes the focus of this study.

Statement of the problem

Lack of ethical behaviors in organizations affects employee performance. When an employee of an organization exhibits a lack of integrity, disloyalty, indolence, self-indiscipline, lack of teamwork and other negative behaviors, he faces losing competence in his work. It is difficult to have a successful organization without well-behaved employees. A lack of ethical behavior can also cause tension among employees, with some employees resenting those who do not play by the rules and still manage to get ahead. Unethical behavior in the workplace also has the potential to lead to a lack of trust among employees, which is detrimental to an organization that relies on collaboration and a sense of teamwork.

Unethical behavior in workplace leads to clientele dissatisfaction that damage organization credibility. If a lack of ethics in an organization becomes public knowledge, that organization loses integrity. Even if an organization recovers from news about its lack of ethics, it takes a lot of time, huge resources and hard work to restore its image and clientele confidence. Clients that abandon an organization because they are dismayed by poor ethical practices will find other products and services to meet their needs. Those clients are difficult to win back, even after ethical lapses are a thing of the past. Even though the civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service deliver essential services which might not be provided by any other organizations, they must be encouraged to uphold ethical standard in workplace.

Admittedly, many factors have been responsible for all forms of unethical behavior in the workplace among the employees of the Enugu State Civil Service. These factors according to include that salaries, wages and allowances paid to workers are abysmally very low. This is a very worrisome situation as all forms of negative attitudes among civil servants are attributable to this. A situation where politicians in Enugu State and Nigeria in general earn huge amount of money every month, while the public servants earn meagre amount that cannot cater for the well-being of their individual families and in an attempt to meet up with daily challenges they however engage in all forms of negative work ethics which ranges from corruption, truancy, abusive acts, doing non-office related work or engage in one form of private business or the other so as to survive, In most cases the employees will be juggling between schooling and the job. This is so because the employees have to go up the ladder by all means possible in order to make ends meet. Schooling itself is not the problem but being a full time worker and at the same time being a full time student will lead the employees to fatigue and the end will be low productivity. The low salaries being paid to civil servants in Enugu State is also worsened by the high rate of inflation which made the lives of civil servants in the state very difficult. This is however compounded by late payment of salaries and allowances among other factors.

In Nigeria the quest for material wealth is seen by most people as the end in itself and as a result, people join the public service as a means to amass wealth. To achieve their objective fund set aside for different purposes are being diverted into personal pockets. This however breeds all forms of corrupt practices in the public service to the extent that salaries and allowances of workers are sometimes tampered with.

The existence of negative workplace behavior in Nigeria public service and Enugu State civil service in particular has been also attributed to lack of involvement of the subordinates in the process of decision-making on issues concerning their workplace and welfare. The management class in the public service demonstrates a high degree of authoritarian leadership style negating the notion that if employees were carried along, it will give them sense of belonging and this will go a long way in motivating them thereby enhancing their performance and eliminating unethical behaviors. Hence, the problem of this study is to periscope the effect of workplace ethics on employees' performance in Enugu State Civil

Service with a view to finding ways of improving on the moral conduct of the civil servants to enhance their performance.

Objectives of the Study

1. To examine the effect of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.
2. To ascertain the effect of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.
3. To assess how teamwork influence the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

Research Questions

1. What is the effect of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service?
2. What is the effect of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service?
3. How does teamwork influence the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service?

Statement of Hypotheses

1. Integrity has significant positive effect on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.
2. Loyalty has significant positive effect on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.
3. Teamwork has significantly influence the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Conceptual Review

Workplace Ethics

Ethics, according to Adeyeye, Adeniji, Osinbanjo and Oludayo (2015), is defined as the science which deals with moral behavior. Ethics is the systematic study of the fundamental principle of the moral law; or as normative science of human conduct. This implies that ethics is basically a normative science, as distinct from the descriptive or empirical sciences. Moral principles that form the subject matter of ethics are about the way people ought to behave in terms of the commitment to their work and their team, integrity and being self-disciplined (Ige, Adeyeye & Aina, 2011). However, workplace ethics is the standardized moral requirements of both the employers and the employees at the workplace. This is to say that workplace ethics is the behaviors that are acceptable in the workplace. Badmus, Ogunlana, (2022) noted that workplace ethics is the accepted standards in terms of personal and social welfare of employee, their work attitudes, self-discipline and commitment to their assignments. He observed that work ethics is the principle conduct governing an individual or a group in the workplace, which makes them conform to the ethical standards thus influencing organizational output level and the resultant clientele satisfaction level.

Measures of Workplace Ethics in Organizations

Various measures of workplace ethics have been used in assessing compliance to certain behaviors and set ethical requirements. Although different organizations set different tools of workplace ethics in achieving their desired vision, the most critical of these measures in civil service according to Ubabuike (2019) are reflected in the perspective of workplace discipline,

teamwork, and organizational commitment and work Attitude. The Code of Conduct serves as a guiding framework for the behavior and actions expected of civil servants within the Enugu State Civil Service Commission outlines the ethical standards, principles, and values that civil servants are expected to uphold in the performance of their duties. The Code of Conduct covers various aspects of behavior, including:

1. **Integrity:** integrity here is defined as a firm adherence to a code of especially moral or artistic values, incorruptibility, unimpaired condition, soundness, the quality or state of being complete or undivided completeness. Integrity is the practice of being honest and showing a consistent and uncompromising adherence to strong moral and ethical principles and values. Civil servants are expected to demonstrate honesty, transparency, and accountability in all their actions. They should avoid conflicts of interest and refrain from engaging in activities that may compromise their impartiality or integrity.
2. **Loyalty:** Loyalty is a sense of duty or devoted attachment to someone's duties or job. loyalty implies a faithfulness that is steadfast in the face of any temptation to renounce, desert, or betray. Loyalty connotes sentiment and the feeling of devotion and respect that one holds for one's work. Civil servants are expected to treat their colleagues, superiors, and members of the public with respect, dignity, and courtesy. They should promote a culture of inclusivity, diversity, and mutual respect in the workplace.
3. **Teamwork:** Teamwork is as old as mankind, and many organizations use the term teamwork in either one sense or the other, such as in the production, marketing processes, etc.. It is a well-known fact that teamwork is not only the foundation of all successful managements, but the means of improving overall results in organizational productivity. Civil servants are expected to engage in communication, collaboration, and coordination with the coworkers in offices. Teamwork is very essential in every organization because it improves competence, diligence, and dedication.

Employees' Performance Indicators

Employee performance is the level of individual employee productivity in relation to job related behavior or expectations, such performance could be judged excellent, good, average or poor when expectations are compared with actual output. Performance in this sense relates to task performance which is behavior oriented depending on the attitude of job holder towards job (Ibrahim & Mohammed, 2019). Employee performance is a measure of how an employee fulfils the duties of their role and behaves in the workplace. Employees are an investment, so their return on investment is essentially calculated by their performance. In Enugu State Civil Service, the key performance indicators (KPIs) of employees according to Eze & Ishiwe (2023) are employee productivity, employee competence, and employee workload, while the key performance indicators (KPIs) of employees according to Igwe, Okolie & Ede (2023) in Enugu State Civil Service are level of clientele satisfaction and output of civil servants.

1. **Level of clientele satisfaction:** The level of clientele satisfaction can be defined as the extent to which a client's experience with a goods, projects, services, or organization exceeds their predetermined satisfaction goals. It is a measure of the client's pleasure or contentment with the goods or services they have received. Clientele satisfaction level is a measure of how satisfied a client is with a product, service, or experience. Clientele satisfaction can be the difference between your employees failing or thriving. If organizations want their goods and services to succeed, especially in these uncertain

times, you have to maintain high satisfaction levels throughout the client journey (Igwe, Okolie & Ede, 2023).

2. **Employee workload delivery:** Employee workload is a form of response to problems at work and to tasks that must be completed by a predetermined date. Eze & Ishiwe (2023) defined workload as the tasks or group of tasks completed by an individual within a specific timeframe under normal conditions. Workload includes all activities that require an employee's time to fulfill their responsibilities, duties, and desires at work, whether it is done directly or indirectly. Workload can be measured through three factors: the work dimension, which refers to the expected work output from employees; work conditions, which refer to an employee's understanding of their working environment; and the use of working time, which refers to the amount of time employees spend on their tasks each day (Eze & Ishiwe, 2023).
3. **Employee competence:** Employee competence refers to the basic feature of an employee which causes superior performance. Competencies are related to knowledge, skills and behaviors which show during their work. They are necessary for successful performance and early signs of achieving those results are presented (Eze & Ishiwe, 2023). Employee competence is the skills, knowledge, abilities and other characteristics that someone needs to perform a job effectively (Jackson & Schuler, 2007, as cited in Eze & Ishiwe (2023).

Theoretical Framework

This study is based on Ethical Theory ascribed to the German philosopher Immanuel Kant. The theory, developed as a result of enlightenment rationalism, is based on the view that the only intrinsically good thing is a good will; an action can only be good if it's factual, and the principle behind it is duty to the moral law. Central to Kant's construction of the moral law is the categorical imperative, which acts on all people, regardless of their interests or desires. Kant formulated the categorical imperative in various ways. This categorical imperative comprises three concepts of good will, reason and duty. These concepts play major roles which are instrumental to the formulation of categorical imperative. He defines moral goodness in terms of goodwill. According to him nothing in the world, indeed nothing even beyond the world-can possibly be conceived which could be called good without qualification except goodwill. Goodwill is good because of its willing; it is good of itself. Therefore, Kant stresses the dominant role of the will in morality. Again, to Kant, the function of reason is to control human action. The practical effectiveness of reason is manifested, not only in the capacity to reflect, but also in the power to originate and inhibit action" (Kant, quoted in Ezedike, 2020). The function of reason is to wrestle with unruly impulses and desires in order to produce the goodwill necessary for a good or moral action. Kant therefore is of the opinion that the will guides us in the performance of our duty. Duty is action which one performs following the dictates of reason, based on goodwill. Such action is devoid of inclination, emotion or self-interest, but simply on the principle of volition. Consciousness of duty, according to Kant is the evidence for the existence of goodwill. And "goodwill is good solely because it acts for the sake of duty, and duty to Kant, is the necessity for acting out of reverence for the moral law (Ezedike, 2020).

These three concepts make up the categorical imperative which Kant regards as the supreme moral principle. Following this principle, an individual would be unable to justify unethical behavior in the workplace, because if everyone should indulge in it, performance will be retard.

Empirical Review

Several empirical literatures examined the relationship between workplace ethics and employee performance in both developing and developed countries, private and public sectors. For instance, Ubabuike (2019) examined the Impact of Organizational Ethics on Employee Performance (A Study of Abia State Civil Service Commission, Umuahia). The study adopted a descriptive survey design and the data gathered for the study was analyzed using descriptive analysis. Pearson correlation was used to test hypotheses with the aid of SPSS. The empirical result of the study showed that there was positive effect of corporate ethics on organizational effectiveness. Also, corporate values had a positive impact on organizational performance.

Oni (2020) examined Ethical Standards and Public Service Delivery in South East, Nigeria. The study adopted descriptive research design. The response rate was 87%. Data collected were tabulated, while mean as well as standard deviation were calculated, and content analysed. Findings revealed that nonadherence to ethical principles for effective operation, lack of commitment and low sense of integrity leading to conflict of interest, corrupt practices and undue award of contracts to associates as well as recruitment not based on merit were observed in the public service of the three states. The study recommended that the state governments of Ebonyi, Enugu and Imo should make policies and practices that encourage sense of integrity and commitment, encourage consistent on the job training and development, motivation of public servants to encourage ethical behavior.

Ibrahim & Mohammed (2020) examined the Effect of Organizational Ethics on Employee Performance in Airline Industry. A survey research design was used and multiple regression analysis was used in analyzing the data. The study revealed that Organizational discipline, Commitment, and Work attitude positively affect employee performance in the Airline industry. However, Organizational teamwork does not positively affect employee performance in same case. This study concludes that ethics serves as organizations guide and encourage employees to practice good behavior for the sake of improving their performance. The study recommends that management of Airline businesses should strive to see the implementation of organizational ethics that can help them to achieve superior performance in terms of Organizational discipline, Commitment and Work attitude.

METHODOLOGY

The study adopted a descriptive survey design. A descriptive survey method refers to a process of eliciting data from a target population through questionnaire or interview instruments, and subjecting such data to statistical analysis for the purpose of drawing conclusions. The use of descriptive survey design is necessary because it helped to ascertain the opinions of the respondents through the administration of questionnaires. This helped to seek answers to the issues raised in the research questions.

The study was conducted with total population of one thousand, six hundred and sixty-four (1,664) staff of Enugu State Ministry of Works and Infrastructure, Ministry of Transport, and Enugu State Ministry of Health. The population is distributed according to the ministries in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Population Distribution

Classification by Ministries	Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	Ministry of Transport	Ministry of Health	Total
Population Size	774	473	417	1664

Source: Enugu State Civil Service Secretariat, Enugu 2024

A sample size of three hundred and twenty-two (322) was determined using the Taro Yamane formula, while the sample size for each stratum was calculated with Sam Kumar's proportional allocation formula. The sample is distributed according to the ministries in Table 2 below.

Table 2: Sample Size Distribution

Classification by Ministries	Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	Ministry of Transport	Ministry of Health	Total
Sample Size	151	91	80	322

Source: Field Survey, 2024

The simple random sampling technique was used to select the sample for the study. The instrument used for the study was a structured questionnaire. The instrument was validated by having two research experts from the Department of Public Administration and Local Government (PALG) and one from Measurement and Evaluation all from the University of Nigeria, Nsukka study the instrument items. Their corrections and suggestions were used to produce the final instrument. The instrument reliability was tested using 10 staff from Enugu State Civil Service. The reliability coefficient was 0.86 using Cronbach Alpha formula. A total of 282 copies of the questionnaire were properly completed and returned for the study (Ministry of Works and Infrastructure was 126, Ministry of Transport was 83 and Ministry of Health was 73). The data generated from the study was presented using descriptive statistics of mean and standard deviation and hypotheses were tested using chi-square (χ^2) inferential statistics to test the relationship between variables.

DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

In this section, the results of data collected are presented and analysed according to the research questions using mean and standard deviation and any item with a mean of 3.00 or above was agreed and strongly agreed while any item with a mean score below 3.00 was disagreed. The hypotheses were also tested using Chi-square (χ^2) analysis at the significant level of 0.05 and the appropriate degree of freedom (DF).

Research Question One: What are the effects of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service?

Table 3: Mean score and standard deviation on the effects of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service

Items	N	Sum	Mean ($\bar{X}$)	Std. Deviation	Decision
Making sure that results being delivered maintain high satisfaction of client expectation	282	1132	3.31	0.47	Agree
Helps keeping the strategy execution on track as planned to put clients first	282	1179	3.45	0.50	Agree
Helps to avoid wastes to meet up with clients demand	282	1101	3.22	0.58	Agree
Enhances employees complete understanding of the needs of clients	282	1152	3.37	0.49	Agree
Integrity increases adequate determination of employees to clientele satisfactions	282	1248	3.65	0.42	Strongly Agree
Helps to ensure that those organizational projects achieved promotes clients satisfaction	282	1255	3.67	0.44	Strongly Agree
Improves employees ability to deliver quality services to clientele satisfactions	282	1275	3.73	0.39	Strongly Agree
Cluster Mean/Pooled Standard Deviation	7	24.40	3.49	0.47	Strongly Agree

Source: Field Survey, 2024

The analyses presented in Table 3 above shows that mean scores of the first four items are above the cutoff point of 3.00 but below 3.50 indicating agree. While the mean scores for the last three items are above 3.50 depicting strongly agree. This shows that all the items are the effects of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

The overall cluster mean score of 3.49 is a strong indication that the items are the effects of integrity on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service. The low pooled standard deviation of 0.47 is an indication that the opinions of the respondents are consistent.

Research Question Two: What are the effects of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service?

Table 4: Mean Score and Standard Deviation on the effects of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service

Items	N	Sum	Mean ($\bar{X}$)	Std. Deviation	Decision
Inspire employees to become more committed to task completion	282	1217	3.56	0.42	Strongly Agree
Increases employees readiness to deliver assigned workload	282	1190	3.48	0.51	Agree
Induce positive behavior towards workload delivery	282	1102	3.22	0.87	Agree
Prepares employees for challenging work targets	282	1064	3.11	0.99	Agree
Discourages delay in completion of a workload	282	1228	3.59	0.62	Strongly Agree
Make employees to be more results-oriented	282	1241	3.63	0.48	Strongly Agree
Motivates employees to stay late at work to deliver assigned workload	282	1155	3.38	0.55	Agree
Cluster Mean/Pooled Standard Deviation	7	23.97	3.42	0.63	Agree

Source: Field Survey 2024

The statistical analysis in Table 4 indicates that 4 items have mean scores above the cutoff point of 3.00 but below 3.50 showing agree. While the mean scores for the remaining 3 items

are above 3.50 depicting strongly agree. This shows that all the items are the effects of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.

The overall cluster mean score of 3.42 is a strong indication that the items are the effects of loyalty on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service. The low pooled standard deviation of 0.63 is an indication that the opinions of the respondents do not differ remarkably on the items.

Research Question Three: How does teamwork influence the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service?

Table 5: Mean Score and Standard Deviation on how teamwork influence the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service

Items	N	Sum	Mean ($\bar{X}$)	Std. Deviation	Decision
Teamwork generates more innovative ideas and solutions that boost employees competence	282	1234	3.61	0.49	Strongly Agree
Helps employees to solve difficult challenges and adapt faster to new work techniques	282	1162	3.40	0.67	Agree
Improves employees' ability to deliver quality services to clients	282	1176	3.44	0.58	Agree
Increases employees' readiness to accept higher responsibilities	282	1244	3.64	0.56	Strongly Agree
Teamwork builds synergy between employees with varied talents, experiences and perspectives which reinforce self-confidence in employees	282	1279	3.74	0.86	Strongly Agree
Builds positive actions and habits that enhance employees' competence	282	1258	3.68	0.72	Strongly Agree
Enhances abilities and other characteristics that employees need to perform a job effectively	282	1217.52	3.56	0.67	Strongly Agree
cluster mean/Pooled Standard Deviation	7	25.07	3.58	0.65	Strongly Agree

Source: Field Survey 2024

The statistical analysis in Table 5 indicates that 2 items have mean scores above the cutoff point of 3.00 but below 3.50 showing agree. While the mean scores for the remaining 5 items are above 3.50 depicting strongly agree. This shows that all the items are how teamwork influences the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

The overall cluster mean score of 3.58 is a strong authentication that the items are the influence of teamwork on the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service. The low pooled standard deviation of 0.65 is a strong indication that the opinions of the respondents do not differ remarkably on the items.

Test of Hypothesis One: Integrity has significant positive effect on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

Calculation of Degree of freedom (DF)

$$DF = (R-1) (C-1)$$

Where R = Number of Row in the contingency table

C = Number of columns in the contingency table

$$DF = (3-1) (5-1)$$

$$= 2 \times 4 = 8$$

At 0.05 significant level and 8 degree of freedom the table value of chi-square = **15.51**

Table 6: Observed Frequency for Hypothesis One

Names of Ministries	Strongly Agree	Agree	No idea	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Total
Works and Infrastructure	68	23	9	15	11	126
Ministry of Transport	26	21	9	16	11	83
Ministry of Health	31	13	2	11	16	73
Total	125	57	20	42	38	282

Source: Field Survey 2022

Table 7: Chi-Square (χ^2) Contingency Table for Hypothesis One

Observed Frequency (o)	Expected Frequency (e)	(o-e)	(o-e) ²	$\frac{(o-e)^2}{e}$
68	1.02	0.98	0.9604	0.01
23	21.66	1.34	1.7956	0.08
9	6.70	2.30	5.2900	0.79
15	3.56	-2.56	6.5536	1.84
11	9.74	-8.74	76.3876	7.84
26	43.70	-12.70	161.2900	3.69
21	8.06	4.94	24.4036	3.03
9	2.91	-0.91	0.8281	0.28
16	16.03	-12.03	144.7209	9.03
11	2.12	-0.12	0.0144	0.00
31	44.65	6.35	40.3225	0.90
13	25.65	-9.65	93.1225	3.63
2	15.74	1.26	1.5876	0.10
11	2.04	4.96	24.6016	1.12
16	14.22	-0.22	0.0484	0.00
				$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum(o-e)^2}{e} = 32.24$

Source: Field Survey 2024

Decision

Since the computed value of chi-square (χ^2) of 32.24 is greater than (>) the table value of chi-square of 15.51, hypothesis one is accepted. The study therefore affirmed that integrity has significant positive effect on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

Test of Hypothesis Two: Loyalty has significant positive effect on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.

Table 8: Observed Frequency for Hypothesis Two

Names of Ministries	Strongly Agree	Agree	No idea	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Total
Works and Infrastructure	43	35	10	12	26	126
Ministry of Transport	26	29	0	18	10	83
Ministry of Health	29	19	5	13	7	73
Total	98	83	15	43	43	282

Source: Field Survey 2024

Table 9: Chi-Square (χ^2) Contingency Table for Hypothesis Two

Observed Frequency (o)	Expected Frequency (e)	(o-e)	(o-e) ²	$\frac{(o-e)^2}{e}$
43	49.15	-6.15	37.8225	0.77
35	27.79	8.21	64.2841	3.57
10	27.61	-17.61	310.1121	11.23
12	24.23	-12.23	149.5729	6.17
26	62.70	0.30	0.09000	0.00.
26	24.13	1.87	3.4969	0.14
29	31.57	-2.57	6.6049	0.21
0	1.19	-1.19	1.4161	1.19
18	17.98	2.02	4.0804	0.24
10	10.13	-0.13	0.0169	0.00
29	1.44	-0.44	0.1936	0.79
19	9.98	-0.98	0.9604	0.05
5	10.29	-5.29	27.9841	1.62
13	12.73	-5.73	32.8329	1.44
7	10.54	-6.54	42.7716	2.44
				$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum(o-e)^2}{e} = 29.86$

Source: Field Survey 2024

Decision

Since the computed value of chi-square (χ^2) of 29.86 is greater than (>) the table value of chi-square of 15.51, hypothesis two is accepted. The statistical result therefore indicated that loyalty has significant positive effect on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service.

Test of Hypothesis Three: Teamwork has significant influence on the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

Table 10: Observed Frequency for Hypothesis Three

Names of Ministries	Strongly Agree	Agree	No idea	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Total
Works and Infrastructure	36	39	7	19	25	126
Ministry of Transport	28	28	5	12	10	83
Ministry of Health	23	15	11	14	10	73
Total	87	82	23	45	45	282

Source: Field Survey 2024

Table 11: Chi-Square (χ^2) Contingency Table for Hypothesis Three

Observed Frequency (o)	Expected Frequency (e)	(o-e)	(o-e) ²	$\frac{(o-e)^2}{e}$
36	41.12	-5.12	26.2144	0.64
39	27.93	11.07	122.5449	1.59
7	21.40	-14.40	207.36	5.86
19	17.00	2.00	4.000	1.33
25	22.39	-6.44	41.4796	1.85
28	20.85	8.15	66.4225	3.19
28	36.04	-8.04	64.6416	1.79
5	4.77	0.23	0.0529	0.01
12	14.89	-2.89	8.3521	0.56
10	7.45	2.55	6.5025	0.87
23	29.44	-0.44	0.1936	0.79
15	20.98	-0.98	0.9604	0.05
11	17.29	-5.29	27.9841	1.62
14	22.73	-5.73	32.8329	1.44
10	17.54	-6.54	42.7716	2.44
				$\chi^2 = \frac{\sum(o-e)^2}{e} = 24.03$

Source: Field Survey 2024

Decision

Since the computed value of chi-square (χ^2) of 24.03 is greater than (>) the table value of chi-square of 15.51, the third hypothesis is accepted. The statistical result therefore indicated that teamwork has significant influence on the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service.

Discussion of Findings

The result of the first hypothesis revealed that integrity has significant positive effect on level of clientele satisfaction of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service. This finding is in consistence with Nurul, Omar & Adawiyah (2020) who discovered that there is a positive relationship between integrity and employee performance. The results of the study portrays that employees with high integrity perform better compared to employees who lack integrity. Contrary to this finding is Adeyeye, Adeniji, Osinbanjo & Oludayo (2015) whose results obtained from their study showed that integrity and discipline have negative impact on the improved productivity level of organization, which could be attributed to the nature of these virtues being abstract and could only be seen or observed over time. But the researchers submit that an organization benefits greatly when its employees demonstrate some measures of integrity and discipline at work. In fact, integrity and discipline at work promotes strong relationships to succeed and raises an environment of commitment, dedication, keenness and devotion amongst the employees which ultimately results in improved employee performance vis-à-vis organizational performance (Adeyeye, Adeniji, Osinbanjo & Oludayo, 2015).

The result of the second hypothesis revealed that loyalty has significant positive effect on employee workload delivery in Enugu State Civil Service. This second finding is supported by Jigjiddorj, Tsogbadrakh, Choihil & Zanabazar (2019) who survey results demonstrated that the employee loyalty positively influenced organizational performance and that employee loyalty can be maintained through increasing employee satisfaction. In the study employee loyalty was considered as independent variable and employee satisfaction as mediating factors while organizational performance was taken as dependent variable. Also in agreement with this finding is that of Tolofari Amah & Okocha (2022) whose results indicated that dimensions of employee loyalty have a significant effect on organizational performance.

The result of the third hypothesis revealed that teamwork has significant influence on the competence of civil servants in Enugu State Civil Service. This finding is in consistence with Adomako, Agor, Terkperterey, Akakposu & Dwomoh (2021) who their study revealed that teamwork has a significant and positive effect on employees and organizational performance. Adeyeye, Adeniji, Osinbanjo & Oludayo (2015) also obtained that teamwork is a strong predictors of organisational productivity. The researchers asserted that with teamwork, creativity in an organization can be achieved. In disagreement with this finding is that of Ibrahim & Mohammed (2020) who finding from the study reveals that organizational teamwork does not positively affect employee performance in Airline industry. What this suggests is that the nature of Airline business in Nigeria does not seemingly require teamwork.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

It is clear from the results that the ethical codes investigated in this study have positive effects on the performance of the civil servants. It is unarguable that the urge to attain and maintain high level of ethical conducts in workplace is desirable for the success and survival of any organization whether public or private. Ethical consideration in labour management relationship is concomitant for organizational development. For high performance, it is important that all stakeholders observe ethical conducts in their dealings with one another. This must be openly displayed through self-discipline, high integrity, loyalty, teamwork, and high sense of professionalism. The above mentioned variables among others serve as indicators of positive work ethics and are crucial for organizational performance as revealed in this study.

Based on the findings and conclusion of the study, the following recommendations were made.

1. In order to strengthen and sustain integrity to improve employees' performance in Enugu State Civil Service and Nigeria in general, policy makers must ensure that workplace ethical codes are consistent with employees' actual experience as well as ensuring that employees' adherence efforts to ethical code of integrity such demonstration of honesty, transparency, and accountability are not overlooked but well compensated.
2. Efforts should be made by the management board of the ministries and Enugu State Civil Service Commission to improve on commitment to providing good working condition and environment in order to stimulate loyalty from employees. This is because when employees are satisfied and pleased with their working condition and environments, it can boost workers contributions which will lead to the attainment of organizational growth.
3. The study also recommends that teamwork activities such as communication, collaboration, coordination, positive synergy, mutual accountability and complementary skills among others have to be encouraged in order to enhance the performance of Enugu State Civil Service and Nigeria in general. One way of improving employees' compliance with ethical standards is by generating sense of threat, while evaluation of ethical behavior is used as a tool to incentivize employees towards behaving ethically. Ethical threats to employees and ethical standards should be printed on the notice boards and effectively implemented to enhance ethical conducts that are concomitant to performance.

REFERENCES

- Adeyeye, J.O, Adeniji, A. A., Osinbanjo, A.O. & Oludayo, O.A (2019). Effects of workplace ethics on employees and organisational productivity in Nigeria, *International Conference on African Development Issues (CU-ICADI)*, 16(4), 267-273, <https://farapaper.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/Fardapaper-Effects-of-Workplace-Ethics-on-Employees-and-Organisational-Productivity-in-Nigeria.pdf>
- Adomako, Agor, Terkper, Akakposu & Dwomoh (2021). Analyzing the impact of teamwork on organizational performance: A case study of Yilo Krobo municipal assembly. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*, 23(1), 323-339 <http://dx.doi.org/10.30574/wjarr.2024.23.1.2021>
- Ahmad, H., Ahmad, K. & Idrees, A.S. (2010). Relationship between job satisfaction, job performance attitude towards work and organizational commitment, *European Journal of Social Sciences*. 18(2), 257-267 http://s3.amazonaws.com/zanran_storage/www.eurojournals.com/ContentPages/140504048.pdf
- Badmus, N.B. Ogunlana, E.K. (2022). Influence of work ethics on service delivery by library personnel in Federal Universities in South West Nigeria. *Samaru Journal of Information Studies*, 22(1), 124-138. <https://www.ajol.info/index.php/sjis/article/view/242365/229179>
- De-Zoysa, A.H.N. (2022). Inculcating professional ethics among employees in the workplace: A systematic literature review, *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies (IJMS)*, 9(1), 21-34. <https://doi.org/10.4038/ijms.v9i1.155>
- Eze, C.C. & Ishiwe, M.U. (2023). Effect of performance appraisal on employee performance in selected Ministries in Enugu State Civil Service. *Journal of Policy and Development Studies (JPDS)*, 14(2), 161-174. <https://dx.doi.org/10.4314/jpds.v14i2.11>
- Ezedike, E.U. (2020). A contemporary analysis of Kant's concept of goodwill and the categorical imperative. *PINISI Discretion Review* 1(1), 185. <http://dx.doi.org/10.26858/pdr.v1i1.13625>
- Ibrahim, U.A. & Mohammed, S.A. (2020). Effect of organizational ethics on employee performance in Airline Industry. *International Journal of Business Marketing and Management (IJBMM)*, 5(1), 01-12. <http://www.ijbmm.com/paper/Jan2020/1587259515.pdf>
- Ige, K., Adeyeye, J.O. & Aina, S. (2011). The impacts of policy and strategic management on Microeconomic indicators in corporate governance, *European Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 207-215 <http://eprints.covenantuniversity.edu.ng/id/eprint/4846>
- Igwe, M.O., Okolie, J.I. & Ede, T.E. (2023). Control management strategies on performance of civil servants in Enugu State. *Advance Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences*, 6(4), 1-17. <https://aspjournals.org/ajahss/index.php/ajahss/article/view/48/49>
- Jigjiddorj, S., Tsogbadrakh, T., Choihil, E. & Zanabazar, A. (2019). The mediating effect of employee loyalty on the relationship between job satisfaction and organizational performance, *Advances in Economics, Business and Management Research*, 78, 197-202 <https://doi.org/10.2991/emt-19.2019.37>

- Nuru, A.A., Omar, K. & Adawiyah, A.K. (2020). Integrity and employee job performance, *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 7(16), 517-521. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/343229901_INTEGRITY_AND_EMPLOYEE_JOB_PERFORMANCE
- Oni, M.A. (2020). Ethical standards and public service delivery in South East, Nigeria, *KIU Journal of Social Sciences*, 6(1): 55-66. <https://ijhumas.com/ojs/index.php/niujobss/article/download/733/672/>
- Salau, O.P., Faiola, H.O. & Akinbode, J.O. (2014). Induction and staff attitude towards retention and organizational effectiveness. *Journal of Business and Management* (IOSR-JBM), 16(4), 47-52. <https://doi.org/10.9790/487X-16464752>
- Tolofari, D.T., Amah, E. & Okocha, N.O. (2022). Employee loyalty an asset for organizational performance, *International Academic Journal of Management and Marketing*, 7(2), 63-76. <https://arcnjournals.org/images/6732425661724.pdf>
- Ulabor, E.A., Akande, S.O., Abiodun, O.B. (2020). Investigating impacts of team-building and organisational leadership on corporate productivity: Case study of selected employees in Osun State Nigeria. *Business, Management and Economics Research*, 6(2), 21-29, <https://doi.org/10.32861/bmer.62.21.29>
- Ubabuike, A.M. (2019). Impact of organizational ethics on employee performance (A Study of Abia State Civil Service Commission, Umuahia). *AKSU Journal of Management Sciences*, 4(2), 127-146. <https://aksujomas.org.ng/articles/19/12/impact-of-organizational-ethics-on-employee-performance-a-study-of-abia-state-civil-service-commission-umuahia/>